The history of the text of the Qur’an has been a longstanding subject of interest within the field of Islamic Studies, but the debate has so far been focused on the Sunni traditions about the codices of Caliphs Abū Bakr and ‘Uthmān b. ‘Affān. Little to no attention has been given to the traditions on ‘Alī b. Abī Ṭālib’s collection of the Qur’an.

This book examines both Shi‘i and Sunni traditions on the issue, aiming to date them back to the earliest possible date and, if possible, verify their authenticity.

To achieve this, the traditions are examined using Harald Motzki’s ḫisād-cum-matn method, which is recognised as an efficient tool in dating the early Islamic traditions and involves analysis of both matn (text) and ḫisād (chain of transmission) with an emphasis on finding a correlation between the two.

"Kara’s application of hadith criticism to Shi‘i sources is innovative as well as constructive. Respectful of others’ contributions, he nonetheless subverts conventional sceptical and starkly sectarianised approaches to Scriptural textual history."

(From the foreword by James Piscatori)
Contents

Foreword by James Piscatori xi

Introduction 1

1 Western Scholarship and the Early History of the Qurʾān: A Short History of Qur’anic Studies in the West 7
   - Discovering the Biblical Roots of the Qurʾan 7
   - Challenging the Muslim Narrations 14
   - Syriac Influence on the Qurʾan 19
   - The Wansbrough School 25
   - Decoding Wansbrough 27
   - ‘Muslim Conspiracy’ Against the Qurʾan 30

2 Muslim Response to the Criticisms of the Textual History of the Qurʾan 37
   - Convincing ‘Non-Believers’ of the Authenticity of the Qurʾan: 38
     - The Traditional Muslim Approach to the History of the Text
     - Arguing Historicity of the Qurʾan 49
     - Use of Archaeological Data 52

3 The Shiʿi Approach to the History of the Collection of the Qurʾān 59
   - Denial of Judeo-Christian Influence on the Qurʾan 59
   - The Issue of tahrīf 65
   - ‘Ali’s Codex in the Earliest Shiʿi Sources 68
   - The Collection of the Qurʾan at the Time of the Prophet 71

4 Introduction to isnād-cum-matn Methodology 75
   - The isnād-cum-matn Method in the Assessment of the Sunni Traditions Regarding the Collection of the Qurʾan 82
   - Employment of the isnād-cum-matn Method on Fewer Variant Traditions 84
   - Criticism of the Method 86
5 Traditions Attributed to Muḥammad Al-Bāqir

Group One Variants
Isnād Analysis
Investigating the Identity of the Reporter
An Analysis of al-Ḵaṭīb’s isnād Patterns
Matn Analysis

Group Two Variants
Isnād Analysis
Matn Analysis

Group Three Variants
Isnād Analysis
Matn Analysis

6 Traditions Attributed to ʿAlī b. Abī Ṭālib

Isnād Analysis
A Brief Study of the Succession Crisis
Matn Analysis

7 Traditions Attributed to Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq

Isnād Analysis
Matn Analysis

8 Traditions Attributed to Ibn Sīrīn

Isnād Analysis
Matn Analysis

Miscellaneous

Conclusion

Appendix
Notes
Bibliography